

ANNEX 3

ITEMS MS LIYANI CLAIMED WERE DISCARDED

Legend: 1st Charge – LML 2nd Charge – Karl 3rd Charge – May 4th Charge – Heather

TABLE A: Items in the possession of LML, May and Heather

S/n	Item	Discarded inside/ outside 49 CL	Remarks
1st Charge – Items in the possession of Liew Mun Leong (“LML”)			
1.	Brown ‘Longchamp’ bag valued at \$200 Photo P1-2 	Outside	<u>3rd statement:</u> She found the two bags (together with other items) in a luggage bag at a rubbish disposal area near 49 CL. ¹ <u>Trial:</u> Ms Liyani found the two bags in a big bag near the rubbish bin at 49D CL at the end of 2010 after renovations. ²
	Blue ‘Longchamp’ bag valued at \$200 Photo P1-3 		

¹ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 8 Dec 2016, A23–A24.

² ROP at p 1711.

3rd Charge – Items in the possession of May Liew (“May”)

2.	<p>One leather ‘Vacheron Constantin’ watch with unknown value</p> <p>Photo P1-23</p> 	Inside	<p><u>5th statement</u>: Picked up from May’s trash (when she was moving out) along with the Swatch watch.³</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Picked up from May’s rubbish bin in May’s room.⁴</p>
3.	<p>One white-coloured ‘Swatch’ watch with orange-coloured design valued at \$75</p> <p>Photo P1-24</p> 	Inside	<p><u>5th statement</u>: Picked up from May’s trash (when she was moving out) along with the Vacheron Constantin watch.⁵</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Cannot remember if she found it in LML or May’s trash.⁶</p>
4.	<p>One silver-coloured ring with blue shiny stones valued at \$150</p> <p>Photo P1-25</p> 	Inside	<p><u>Trial</u>: Found in May’s rubbish bin in 2011 or 2012 after May collected her items from storage, and intended to give it to her nieces.⁷</p>

³ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A11.

⁴ ROP at pp 1693–1694.

⁵ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A11.

⁶ ROP at p 1694.

⁷ ROP at p 1696.

5.	<p>One pair of silver-coloured earrings with white opaque stones valued at \$150</p> <p>Photo P1-26</p> 	Inside	<p><u>5th statement</u>: Found in May's trash along with other items May discarded when she was moving out of LML's home.⁸</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Found in May's rubbish bin in 2011 or 2012 after May collected her items from storage, and intended to give it to her nieces.⁹</p>
6.	<p>One yellow-coloured earring with one white opaque ball valued at \$75</p> <p>Photo P1-27</p> 	Inside	<p><u>Trial</u>: Found in May's rubbish bin in 2011 or 2012 after May collected her items from storage, and intended to give it to her nieces.¹⁰</p>
7.	<p>An assortment of fashion accessories valued at \$400</p> <div data-bbox="197 767 907 986" style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <p>Ring (with rose)</p> <p>Photo P1-28</p>  </div> <div data-bbox="197 991 907 1209" style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <p>Earrings with tribal design</p> <p>Photo P1-29</p>  </div>	Inside	<p><u>5th statement</u>: Picked up many of these accessories from May's trash when May was moving out.¹¹</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Found the items (save for P1-33 and P1-38) in May's rubbish bin in 2011 or 2012 after May collected her items from storage, and intended to give it to her nieces.¹²</p>

⁸ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A16.

⁹ ROP at p 1696.

¹⁰ ROP at pp 1696–1697.

¹¹ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A5–A27.

¹² ROP at pp 1697–1701.

Dolphin earrings
Photo P1-30



Hook blue stone earrings
Photo P1-31



Rose stud earrings
Photo P1-32



Pearl hook earrings
Photo P1-33



Disney accessories
Photo P1-34



Stud earrings
Photo P1-35



Single flower stud earring
Photo P1-36



Single earring
Photo P1-37



Single earring
Photo P1-38



<p>Single hooked earring with white stone Photo P1-39</p> 		
<p>Single stud earring Photo P1-40</p> 		

4th Charge – Items in the possession of Heather Lim (“Heather”)

<p>8. One purple-coloured ‘Prada’ bag valued at \$1,000 Photo P1-42</p> 	<p>Outside</p>	<p><u>5th statement</u>: Found this bag together with the two ‘Longchamp’ bags in an abandoned suitcase near the rubbish area outside LML’s home.¹³</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Retrieved the bag from one of two black plastic rubbish bags “in front of” 49CL on the evening of Karl and Heather’s move to 39CL.¹⁴</p>
--	----------------	--

¹³ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A41.

¹⁴ ROP at p 1731.

9.	<p>One pair of black-coloured ‘Gucci’ sunglasses with red stains valued at \$500</p> <p>Photo P1-43</p> 	Outside	<p><u>5th statement</u>: Found the sunglasses in Karl’s trash bag when he was moving house.¹⁵</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Retrieved the sunglasses from one of two black plastic rubbish bags at 49CL on the evening of Karl and Heather’s move to 39CL.¹⁶</p>
----	---	---------	--

TABLE B: Items in the possession of Karl

2 nd Charge – Items in the possession of Karl Liew (“Karl”)			
10.	<p>‘Helix’ watch valued at \$50</p> <p>Photo P1-18</p> 	Inside	<p><u>Trial</u>: Found the watch in rubbish bin in Karl’s room before the renovations to 49CL.¹⁷</p>
11.	<p>‘Gerald Genta’ watch valued at \$25,000</p> <p>Photo P1-19</p> 	Outside	<p><u>3rd statement</u>: Found the watch in a black rubbish bag at a rubbish bin outside LML’s home in March 2016, when Karl was moving out and had thrown items away.¹⁸</p> <p><u>5th statement</u>: Maintains that she found it in Karl’s trash when Karl was moving house.¹⁹</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Retrieved the watch from one of two black plastic rubbish bags “in front of” 49CL on the evening of Karl and Heather’s move to 39CL.²⁰</p>

¹⁵ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A51.
¹⁶ ROP at p 1731.
¹⁷ ROP at p 1733.
¹⁸ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 8 Dec 2016, A35.
¹⁹ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A50.
²⁰ ROP at p 1728.

<p>12.</p>	<p>Two white-coloured 'iPhone 4' mobile phones with accessories valued at \$2,056</p> <p>Photo P1-20 to P1-22</p> 	<p>Outside</p>	<p><u>2nd statement</u>: Found these items in Karl's trash in March 2016, when she sorted through his trash at the rubbish area.²¹</p> <p><u>3rd statement</u>: Maintains that she found these items in Karl's trash in March 2016.²²</p> <p><u>5th statement</u>: Maintains that she found these items in Karl's trash in March 2016.²³</p> <p><u>Trial</u>: Retrieved the phones from one of two black plastic rubbish bags "in front of" 49CL on the evening of Karl and Heather's move to 39CL.²⁴</p>
------------	--	----------------	--

²¹ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 4 Dec 2016, A100–A101.

²² Statement of Ms Liyani dated 8 Dec 2016, A31.

²³ Statement of Ms Liyani dated 29 May 2017, A52.

²⁴ ROP at p 1728.

